

## Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)

Syamsidar<sup>1</sup>, Mansur Suma<sup>2</sup>, Sadhriany Pertiwi Saleh<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar

Corresponding Author : [sadhriany.pertiwi@uin-alauddin.ac.id](mailto:sadhriany.pertiwi@uin-alauddin.ac.id)

**ABSTRACT:** Women play a crucial role in regional planning, especially in the context of inclusive and sustainable development. Their involvement in the planning process not only brings diverse perspectives but also helps tackle various challenges they often face, such as discrimination and limited access to resources. In many settings, women's voices are frequently overlooked, which limits the community's ability to respond effectively to the needs of all members. This study is a descriptive qualitative, bibliographic, and documentary research. It aims to describe and provide a comprehensive overview of the studied phenomenon, specifically the dynamics of power relations and social norms influencing women's participation in development planning (case study in the city of Makassar, South Sulawesi). The findings indicate that women's participation in the City Development Planning (City Deliberation) in Makassar is still relatively low. Only about 30% of participants are women. Despite this, women's contributions in proposing ideas show significant potential to improve the quality of development planning, with many proposals focusing on issues relevant to community needs, especially those affecting women and children. Several factors influence women's participation: 1) patriarchal culture and norms; 2) lack of access to information; 3) educational and skills limitations; and 4) policy support. Overall, women's involvement in City Development Planning in Makassar faces several challenges that must be addressed to promote more inclusive and responsive development. Efforts to boost women's participation should involve a multidimensional approach, including improving access to information and education, and transforming social norms that limit women's roles in planning. These steps are expected to maximize women's roles in development, leading to policies and programs that are relevant and sustainable for the entire community. The study also finds that social norms and power dynamics play a vital role in shaping women's involvement in Makassar's development planning. Specifically: 1) Discrimination and stereotypes: Social norms that undermine women's roles and reinforce gender stereotypes hinder their active participation. Many women feel pressured to conform to traditional roles, preventing them from voicing their opinions publicly; 2) Education and awareness: The lack of understanding about the importance of involvement in planning is worsened by norms that depict women as disempowered in development contexts. This highlights the need for greater educational efforts and awareness campaigns to boost women's participation (Kabeer, 2019); 3) Dominance of male voices: The prevailing power dynamics often favor men in decision-making processes, leading to structural injustices. Women's voices are often ignored in key decisions, which negatively impacts policy quality; 4) Inequality in access to information and resources also plays a role in the low participation of women. Without adequate access, women cannot effectively engage in development planning.

**KEYWORDS:** Power Relations; Social Norms; Development Planning; Social Welfare.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Women play a crucial role in regional planning, particularly in the context of inclusive and sustainable development. Their engagement in the planning process not only introduces diverse perspectives but also helps address various challenges they frequently encounter, such as discrimination and limited access to resources. In many contexts, women's voices are often overlooked, which restricts the community's ability to effectively respond to the needs of all its members (Bennett, 2019; Risman, 2018; UN Women, 2020).

Concrete efforts to enhance women's participation in regional planning can lead to fairer and more equitable outcomes. Previous research indicates that active involvement of women in urban planning can create environments that are more responsive to

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

community needs, including the provision of public facilities and infrastructure development (Haq & Sulaiman, 2021). By creating platforms for women to participate, governments not only promote gender equality but also foster more innovative and creative solutions to urban challenges (Miller, 2022).

However, despite progress in women's involvement in planning, various challenges persist, particularly in Indonesia. Patriarchal norms, lack of access to education, and limited opportunities for participation in public forums remain significant barriers (Risman, 2018; UN Women, 2020). Data from the Ministry of National Development Planning indicates that women's participation in the City Development Planning (Development Planning Consultation Forum) still falls below that of men, averaging between 30-40% (Ministry of PPN/Bappenas, 2020).

This study focuses on Makassar, which presents unique challenges in engaging women in development planning. Against this backdrop, the research aims to address two main questions: (1) How do women participate in the development planning process through City Development Planning in Makassar? and (2) What obstacles do women face in becoming involved in development planning in this city? This study is expected to provide insights for policymakers and stakeholders in their efforts to foster more inclusive and sustainable development.

### **2. RESEARCH METHODS**

This study is a descriptive qualitative, bibliographic and documentary research. This research aims to describe and provide a comprehensive overview of the phenomenon being studied, which in this case is dynamics of power relations and social norms in women's participation in development planning (case study in the city of makassar, south sulawesi). As Qualitative research, this study involves exploring and understanding phenomena in depth, often by collecting non-numerical data such as interviews, observations, and textual analysis. In the context of this study, qualitative methods would likely be used to gather insights into the nature of human-machine interaction, the cultural implications of digitalization, and the communication dynamics in digital environments.

This study also relies on existing literature and scholarly works as primary sources of information. Researchers conducting bibliographic research typically review and analyze a wide range of academic articles, books, reports, and other publications related to the topic of interest. Documentary research involves the systematic analysis of existing documents, records, and artifacts to gather data and insights relevant to the research question.

By employing a descriptive qualitative, bibliographic, and documentary research approach, the study aims to provide a detailed and comprehensive examination of the interplay between humans and machines in driving the digitalization of culture and communication. This approach allows researchers to explore the complexities of the phenomenon from multiple perspectives, drawing on existing literature and documentary evidence to develop rich insights and interpretations.

### **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### **1. Profile Women's Participation in Deliberation Development Planning ( City Development Planning ) in Makassar City**

In the context of planning development, Deliberation Development Planning (City Development Planning) is an important forum to accommodate societal aspirations, including women. This research analyzes the number and proportion of women present in City Development Planning in Makassar City and compares it with the total participants. Although some women participate, the 30% proportion indicates a significant gap in involvement involvement in the planning process Factors influencing this low proportion include that many women feel they are not allowed to participate in public forums due to cultural norms that tend to be patriarchal. Lack of access for women also plays a role to information about City Development Planning and planning process development also reduces involvement Woman in City Development Planning. A number of informant women also don't receive support from their family or community to participate in city development activities.

In this study, the researcher analyzes the demographics of participants involved in Deliberation Development Planning (City Development Planning) in Makassar City, focusing on age, education, and socioeconomic background. Understanding the characteristics of demographic participants is very important to evaluate the extent to which various groups are represented in the development planning process. This research finds that the majority of participants aged 30-50 years have more experience and responsibilities, which influence their views on development planning (Haq & Sulaiman, 2021).

Furthermore, the relatively high level of education among participants contributes to better quality discussions and proposals in City Development Planning. However, low participation among women from backgrounds with lower education levels shows that obstacles still need to be addressed to increase inclusivity (Risman, 2018). Additionally, inequality in income and employment affects participants' ability to engage actively. Participants from more economically stable backgrounds are generally better able

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

to attend City Development Planning sessions and voice their aspirations.

The study emphasizes the need for training and education programs to increase participation among women, especially those from backgrounds with lower education levels. Support initiatives for women from economically disadvantaged backgrounds must be introduced so they can participate without burdensome responsibilities related to economic matters. These findings highlight the importance of considering participant demographics in the development planning process to make it more inclusive and responsive to the needs of all public groups.

### **a. Women's Participation Form**

1) **Active Participation:** Engagement in discussions, submission of proposals, and giving opinions. This research finds that women actively participate in Deliberation Development Planning (City Development Planning) in Makassar City. Active participation includes involvement of women in discussions, submission of proposals, and offering opinions in the planning development context. Data was collected through interviews, direct observations, and document analysis related to City Development Planning.

2) **Passive Participation:** Passive participation is defined as women being present in the forum without actively engaging in discussions, proposing submissions, or sharing opinions. The research finds that although the number of women recorded as present is quite significant, their involvement in discussions shows different patterns. Out of 500 total participants, approximately 150 were women, indicating good representation in terms of presence. However, about 60% of these women are not actively involved in discussions. From the interviews conducted, several factors causing passive participation among women were identified: 1) **Social Norms:** Many women feel they have no space to speak or fear evaluation by other participants, especially men. This reflects a strong stigma in public spaces. 2) **Lack of Support:** Many women who attend do not receive encouragement from the community or family to participate actively. Some participants reported feeling alone and lacking supportive partners to share their opinions.

### **2. Factors Supporters and Barriers to Women's Participation**

#### **a. Policy government**

Policy at both the government level in Makassar city and nationally plays an important role in encouraging women to participate in development planning. First is the Women's Empowerment Program. The Makassar City Government has launched various programs aimed at empowering women, such as training skills and capacity improvement programs in economic and social fields. These programs not only increase women's skills but also help build their confidence to participate in public forums.

Second is Inclusive Policy. Efforts from the government ensure that women are involved in city development planning and other planning processes. For example, policies that encourage women's representation in local government structures and public institutions. Another supporting factor is socialization and support: the government is also active in socializing the importance of women's roles in development, which helps create public awareness of the contributions women can make.

#### **b. Awareness Woman will importance participation in development.**

Awareness among women highlights the importance of participation in development planning, which also becomes a significant positive factor. Findings from the study show that increasing awareness through various campaigns and training sessions has led many women to realize that their involvement in the planning process can influence decisions that directly impact their lives and the community. This is evidenced by an increase in the number of women who attended and participated in City Development Planning.

Second, involvement in social networks—active women in organized public groups—has strengthened awareness of the collective will and the importance of participation in development. They support each other and share information about methods to get involved in the planning process.

Third, motivation to contribute—women state that the desire to improve their living conditions and those of their children is the main motivation for involvement in development planning. Awareness of this has driven them to participate more actively in related forums focused on development.

Positive factors such as government policy support and increased awareness among women significantly contribute to women's participation in planning and development in Makassar City. Although challenges still exist, ongoing efforts to empower women and create inclusive policies show positive progress. This study also identified several negative factors that hinder women's participation in planning and development in Makassar City. The two main issues highlighted are cultural and normative obstacles related to patriarchy, as well as lack of access to information and education.

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

### **a. Obstacle culture and norms**

Culture and norms of strong patriarchy in Makassar society contribute significantly to low participation of women in the planning and development process. First, gender stereotypes: Many women face limiting stereotypes about their roles in the public sphere. Social norms that consider women should focus more on domestic and family business cause them to feel no entitlement to be involved in public discussions.

Second is concern about assessment: Women often worry about negative evaluations from the public if they participate in public forums. This fear causes many women to choose not to speak, even when they have valid and constructive views. Furthermore, there is male domination in decision-making: Decision-making processes in many forums are often dominated by men, resulting in women's voices being neglected. This creates an environment that does not support women in expressing their opinions.

### **b. Lack of access to information and education.**

Lack of access to information and education also becomes a significant factor that inhibits women in planning development. Findings in the study show that limitations in access to information mean many women do not get adequate information about city development planning and the planning process. These limitations can be caused by various factors, including low education levels and a lack of effective socialization from the government.

Furthermore, there is a lack of formal education. Data shows that many women in Makassar City do not possess sufficient formal education. This limits their ability to understand and participate in the planning process. Approximately 30% of women involved in city development planning only have a basic education. Besides that, there is a lack of training in relevant skills. In addition to formal education, many women also lack training in skills necessary to participate in planning forums. Without communication skills and knowledge about development issues, women will find it difficult to convey their opinions.

Several factors affect women's participation: 1) Obstacles such as patriarchal culture and norms; strong gender stereotypes and dominance by men in decision-making create major barriers for women to participate actively. The stereotype that women should focus on household duties makes them feel they have no room for involvement in public forums. 2) Lack of Access to Information; many women do not receive sufficient information about the city development planning process, including how to participate and its importance. This is due to ineffective socialization and education about planning and development. 3) Limited Education and Skills; low levels of education and communication skills among women also hinder their ability to engage in discussions and effectively submit proposals. Many women involved in city development planning come from backgrounds with minimal education, reducing their confidence in participating. 4) Support Policies; although there are supportive policies for women's involvement, their implementation and monitoring remain weak. Policy quotas and empowerment programs for women need to be strengthened to enable more women to participate actively.

## **3. Women's Participation and Inclusivity Development Policy**

The quality of the proposal submitted in the City Development Planning forum is very crucial to ensure that the needs of society, including women, are accommodated in the development plan. In this study, the researcher found that active women who participate in City Development Planning tend to submit comprehensive and relevant proposals that address community needs. Findings from the study show that out of a total of 100 proposals submitted to the City Development Planning, around 30% were submitted by women. This indicates that although women are a minority in terms of quantity, their contributions in proposal submission are quite significant. The proposals submitted by women often include fewer issues to be noted, such as public security, facilities for health services for mothers and children, and empowerment programs aimed at increasing family welfare. Quality proposals submitted by women in City Development Planning show several aspects of inclusivity that reflect the specific needs of their groups, such as relevance to local needs. Proposals submitted by women are often more relevant to local needs. Informant women in the study disclose that many proposals include development of safe public spaces for women and children, as well as improved access to health services. Additionally, proposals from women tend to adopt a participatory approach, inviting members of other communities to be involved in planning and implementation. This shows that women think not only of their own interests but also consider the welfare of the community overall.

Research data also shows that women propose innovative and creative solutions to existing problems. Informant women in the study disclose that they suggest training programs designed specifically to enhance skills for women in the informal sector, thereby increasing employment opportunities. Involving women in development planning meetings promotes improvements in discussion quality; when women participate actively, discussions on city development become richer and more diverse. This creates opportunities to generate higher-quality proposals. Women's participation also fosters inclusivity by revealing hidden needs, as their involvement in planning helps uncover frequently neglected issues often overlooked in development strategies dominated by men's perspectives.

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

Several informants in the study highlight the need for the government to develop strategies that encourage greater involvement of women in city development planning, including providing necessary training and support. Additionally, evaluating proposals is essential to develop mechanisms that assess proposal quality based on women's contributions, ensuring their perspectives are integrated into plan development. This research finds that women's participation is not only crucial for achieving gender equality but also for enhancing the quality of proposals submitted for development planning.

Furthermore, women's involvement in planning and decision-making processes impacts the quality of life in society in Makassar City across various aspects. First, in the provision of public facilities, proposals submitted by women focus on immediate community needs, such as safe public spaces, health facilities, and access to education. Listening to women's voices makes development more relevant and better targeted. Next, in economic empowerment programs, women's participation supports the development of more inclusive economic initiatives, such as skills training for women in the informal sector. This not only increases household income but also strengthens the community's economic resilience.

Women's participation also promotes responsiveness to community needs. When women are involved in decision-making, they bring a unique and profound perspective on community needs. This makes development planning more responsive and adaptable to existing social dynamics. Additionally, active participation of women in city development planning helps reduce social injustice by ensuring issues faced by women, such as gender-based violence and access to basic services, receive proper attention in plan development.

Women's involvement in planning and development also contributes to increased public awareness and concern regarding gender issues. Through women's participation, society as a whole becomes more aware of the importance of gender equality and its impact on sustainable development. This fosters a more inclusive and supportive culture for women's participation in the future. Engagement in public forums also helps women build stronger social networks, which in turn enhances solidarity and mutual support among them.

*"Government and public organizations need to develop education and training programs that support women's participation in development."*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

*"A more comprehensive policy inclusive of needs should be applied to ensure that women's perspectives are accommodated in all aspects of planning and development."*

### **Informant - Kartini**

Research data shows that women's participation in planning development has an impact on creating more inclusive and responsive development. This includes aspects of inclusivity that reflect the specific needs of women from different backgrounds and the relevance of policies to local needs.

*"Government area need carry out campaign more socialization intensive about the City Development Planning process and its benefits. Material socialization must customized with context local and easy language understood by women in various layer public."*

### **Informant - Haeruddin**

*Building online and offline platforms that provide information about development planning, including methods for involved parties, as well as the timetable for City Development Planning which will come.*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

The study discloses that the training program is designed to increase women's skills in communication and in composing good suggestions. This training covers presentation techniques, project management, and understanding local development issues.

*"Provide educational courses to the public about the importance of gender equality in development planning so that it creates greater awareness and encourages wide participation of women."*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

Besides that, implementing quota policies ensures that women have sufficient representation in the City Development Planning forum. This can also help create gender balance in decision-making.

*"Apply quota policies to ensure women have sufficient representation in the City Development Planning forum. This can promote gender balance in decision-making."*

### **Informant - Kartini**

*"Provide a special budget for the designed program aimed at empowering women, including initiatives to improve their involvement in planning and project implementation."*



## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

### **Informant - Haeruddin**

The government needs to build partnerships with civil society organizations that focus on women's empowerment. These organizations can help reach women who may not have direct access to public forums.

*"Promote the formation of social networks among women for sharing information and experiences, which can increase self-trust and motivation to participate in planning."*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

*"Form a mechanism to evaluate the impact of policies and programs that aim to increase women's participation in planning. This evaluation can serve as a basis for improving future policies."*

### **Informant – Kartini**

*"Determine clear indicators for measure level participation Woman in City Development Planning and its influence to results development."*

### **Informant - Haeruddin**

Inclusivity in planning development in Makassar City through the participation of women in city development planning and regional planning in Makassar City becomes the foundation for further development that is inclusive and responsive to society's needs. The implementation of inclusive policy based on participation from all parties is supported by a commitment from stakeholders' interests, including the government, public organizations, civil society, and the general public.

## **4. Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Involvement in Development Planning in Makassar City**

### **a. Social Norms**

Social norms are rules and standards that are not written but regulate individual behavior in a society. These norms are formed based on traditions, values, and beliefs held by the community. In Makassar society, social norms function as guidelines that influence how individuals interact and participate in various aspects of life, including the planning process of development. Discrediting the role of social norms that restrict women and reinforce gender stereotypes hampers their active participation. Many women feel stressed about still being assigned traditional roles, which makes them hesitant to voice their opinions in public forums (Hasyim, 2020). A lack of understanding about the importance of involvement in planning is also caused by norms that view women as not empowered within the development context. This shows the need for better education and awareness to increase women's participation (Kabeer, 2019).

In Makassar City, traditional gender norms are still very strong. Women are often seen as not fully capable of handling domestic matters, while men are more dominant in public affairs and decision-making. This results in low participation of women in planning forums like City Development Planning. Research finds that some women feel they have no right to speak in public because of social norms that require them to stay at home. Additionally, stereotypes also suggest that women are not sufficiently capable in leadership and decision-making, which further hinders their participation.

*"In lots of situations, women possibly have good ideas and suggestions, but they are reluctant to share them because they worry they will be rejected or ignored by men."*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

Studies show that many women informants in Makassar feel their voices are not heard in City Development Planning, even though they participate in the forum. Social environment also plays an important role in shaping these norms. In more conservative communities, there is pressure from fellow community members to conform to traditional norms. The research finds that women from more open communities are more active in development planning compared to those from conservative communities.

In some cases, women are expected to follow decisions made by their husbands, including in matters of participation in public forums. This creates a gap in women's involvement in development planning because their decisions often depend on men's agreement. The norm that considers formal education as unimportant for women also impacts their participation. Without adequate education, women often feel they lack confidence to participate in developmental discussions. Low levels of education in women become a significant barrier in formal forums that influence policy development. The research also finds that the view that women's involvement in public affairs is uncommon can lead to negative stigmas for women who try to participate actively, such as assumptions that they do not conform to traditional roles as mothers or homemakers.

Social norms in Makassar society, in several aspects, impact women's participation in development planning. Traditional gender perspectives, stereotypes about women's roles in society, and social pressure act as obstacles for women to contribute to planning development.

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

*" More women can participate if there is more effort from the government and society to support social norm changes and improve participation.*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

Social norms that apply in Makassar society, on one side, play an important role in encouraging women's participation in the development planning process.

#### **a. Inhibitor Participation**

1) **Dominance of Male Roles:** Norms that place men as the primary decision-makers in families and communities create barriers for women to get involved. When women feel that their voices are not considered important, they tend to avoid active participation in forums like City Development Planning. This triggers a cycle of gender inequality in decision-making.

2) **Views on Women's Involvement:** In a traditional social context, there is an assumption that women should focus more on domestic responsibilities. This assumption makes many women feel unworthy of being involved in public planning, so they choose not to participate, even if they have relevant ideas.

#### **b. Quality Participation**

1). **Low Trust Self:** Stereotypes that assume women are not capable enough in leadership and decision-making can reduce their self-trust. Many women feel hesitant to convey proposals or opinions in forums, which impacts the quality of their participation.

2). **Lack of Proposals Submitted:** Due to inhibiting norms, proposals submitted by women are often fewer compared to men. This creates bias in planning and development, where women's needs and perspectives are not adequately accommodated.

Constraints on women's involvement in planning and development are conditions that can impact long-term outcomes. First, these constraints can escalate to unsustainable, inclusive development. Powerlessness among women to participate actively in planning contributes to policies that do not reflect the needs of all members of society. This can cause dissatisfaction and injustice in the distribution of resources and power, especially concerning the needs of women and children. Furthermore, these conditions create dependence. When women are not involved in decision-making processes, they become more dependent on decisions made by men, which can limit their ability to contribute independently in the future.

Overall, social norms in Makassar society significantly impact women's participation in planning and development. To achieve more inclusive planning, it is necessary to change these norms and create a supportive environment for women's involvement. This includes awareness campaigns, education on gender equality, and policies that encourage active participation by women.

According to Bourdieu (1990), norms are social frameworks that shape individual behavior in society. In the Makassar context, norms that assign women to domestic roles and consider men as the primary decision-makers create strong boundaries to women's participation. This research finds that women often feel unworthy of being involved in public planning because of prevailing norms. Stereotypes that assume women are not capable of making critical decisions reinforce inequality. These research results align with gender theory, which states that negative stereotypes can hinder women's participation in various aspects of life, including the public sector (Kabeer, 2019).

### **b. Dynamics of Power Relations**

The relation between dominating power and men often results in decision-making being biased toward them, which produces structural injustice. Women are often overlooked in making important decisions, which impacts the quality of policy development (Miller, 2022). Inequality in access to information and resources also contributes to women's low involvement. Without adequate access, women cannot participate effectively in planning development (Aminah, 2019).

*" A number of non- governmental organizations and communities local play a role in facilitate participation society , including women . However , the influence they often limited If No supported by policy inclusive government . "*

### **Informant - Septhiany**

Strength of local community in planning development is often hampered by social norms and existing hierarchical structures. Women in the community often do not have an equal voice in decision-making, even though they are an important part of society. The power structure in planning and development in Makassar is dominated by men, both at the government level and within society. This results in a lack of representation of women in decision-making.

*" There is a necessary effort to create a system that is more inclusive and responsive by remodeling power structures, increasing women's involvement, and changing social norms surrounding their roles."*

### **Informant - Kartini**

One of the main traditional views on gender has become a trigger for dynamics in gender relations and participation in planning in Makassar City. In many contexts in Makassar, women are perceived through stereotypes that place them in domestic roles. This research finds that this view considers women as more suitable for looking after household chores and family, thus ignoring their

## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

ability to contribute in the public realm, including in planning development.

Another assumption is that women do not have enough capacity and skills to be involved in complex decision-making processes. These stereotypes are often used to justify the lack of representation of women in leadership positions within government and planning institutions. This view then impacts low self-trust among women to be involved in planning.

*“ Negative perception about a woman's ability can decrease her self-trust. Many women feel that their voices and opinions will not be appreciated, which leads them to be passive in planning forums like City Development Planning. ”*

### **Informant - Haeruddin**

Constraint other is Limitations Access. The view that women should not be involved in public affairs hinders their access to information and opportunities to participate in planning. This impacts the low level of education and training for women in related fields such as planning and decision-making. Although there is a dominant negative perspective, there are several aspects that support changing the dynamics of power relations. Empowerment programs for women and initiatives that encourage women's involvement in public policy are slowly shifting traditional norms. This can contribute to changing perceptions about women's roles and capabilities (Miller, 2022).

A number of cases show women's success in leadership also support changing societal views. Success in leadership demonstrates that women are capable of leading and contributing significantly, which can help dismantle existing stereotypes and encourage greater involvement of women in planning and development (Bennett, 2019). Stereotypes about women in positions of power in Makassar are greatly influenced by social and gender norms. This perception impacts women's participation in planning and development, creating significant challenges for their involvement.

### **c. Traditional Social Norms on Gender Roles**

Gender-based discrimination is one of the main obstacles faced by women in planning and development in Makassar City. Discrimination appears in various forms, from excluding women from decision-making to unfair treatment in the allocation of resources and power. Research shows that some women feel they have no right to participate in public forums like City Development Planning. This results in limited access and opportunities. Traditional social norms regarding gender roles lead to limited access for women to information about planning and development. Many women do not get the chance to be involved in important discussions, causing their proposals and needs to be overlooked. These norms are reinforced by society's views that women should not be involved in public affairs, creating a stigma that hinders women from actively participating in planning and development.

Deep-rooted stereotypes about gender roles also significantly hinder women's participation. These stereotypes view women as only suited for domestic roles and discourage them from taking part in decision-making in the public sphere. Many women feel trapped in domestic roles expected by society and hesitate to take brave steps to participate in planning processes. Research shows that stereotypes prevent women from proposing ideas and suggestions. The lack of women in leadership positions or active roles in planning further reinforces these stereotypes. When women do not see successful female representatives in this field, they tend to lack confidence in their own ability to be involved. Obstacles from social norms, including traditional gender roles and stereotypes, greatly influence women's participation in planning and development in Makassar City. To increase women's involvement, efforts are needed to change these social norms through education and awareness campaigns that emphasize the important role of women in development.

### **d. Inequality Gender- Based Power Relations**

One of the significant obstacles to women's participation in planning development in Makassar City is unequal access to information and power resources. This creates gaps that affect women's ability to be actively involved. This research found that women experience difficulties in accessing information related to planning and development, whether through official channels or informal ones. A lack of understanding about the planning and policy process often makes women feel isolated from important discussions. Gender-based power inequalities are also triggered by sources of power that are unevenly distributed. The research found that women often do not have equal access to power sources such as training, education, and financial support. Without access to these, women cannot build the capacity to participate in decision-making related to development.

Male domination in decision-making is another significant challenge for women's participation. The existing power structures tend to favor men, resulting in women's voices being marginalized. Gender hierarchy in decision-making means that, in many planning forums such as City Development Planning, men are usually the main decision-makers. This causes women's perspectives and needs to often be unrepresented in the decisions made. Additionally, there is a lack of representation of women. Although efforts are made to involve women, many women feel that their contributions are not appreciated. The research found that without women in leadership positions, it is difficult to produce pro-women policies. Power relations obstacles, including unequal access



## **Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)**

to information and resources, as well as male domination in decision-making, greatly impact women's participation in planning development in Makassar City.

Foucault (1980) stated that power is not only located in formal institutions but also within everyday social connections. In the context of planning development, relationships of power that favor men in decision-making create structural injustices that limit women. The research shows that men's voices are often heard and valued more, while women's voices are marginalized. This domination in decision-making also supports the view that without women in leadership roles, policies tend not to be responsive to women's needs. This theory helps clarify how unbalanced power relations can lead to decisions that are not inclusive.

This study finds that obstacles stemming from social norms and power relations affecting women's participation in Makassar can be analyzed through perspectives on social norms and power relations. Norms that inhibit participation and the dominance of men's voices in decision-making highlight the importance of restructuring social and power structures. To achieve more inclusive planning development, supportive interventions aimed at gender equality are required, both through changing social norms and adjusting power relations. The obstacles women face in participating in planning development in Makassar City, from social norms and power relations, significantly impact inclusive development outcomes.

(1). Low Active Participation: Inequality in access to information, resources, power, and voice causes women to be passively involved. This minimal involvement means women's perspectives and needs are often not integrated into the planning process, reducing the effectiveness of the resulting solutions.

(2). Limited Proposal Quality: Women's inability to participate actively affects the quality of proposals submitted in planning and development. When women are not involved, important issues related to their welfare and the community are overlooked, creating unfairness in the distribution of resources, power, and public services.

(3). Injustice in Policy: Limited participation by women can lead to policies that do not respond to the needs of all citizens. This creates gaps in development that harm women and society overall because the solutions do not consider all perspectives.

(4). Lack of Sustainability: Without women's involvement, development initiatives tend to lack sustainability. Research shows that projects involving women are more likely to consider important social and environmental impacts, resulting in more positive outcomes for the community.

Obstacles faced by women in participation planning development in Makassar City directly impact the quality and inclusiveness of planning, said experts. To achieve more fair and sustainable development, it is important to overcome these constraints by encouraging active involvement of women and ensuring their voices are heard at every stage of planning. With appropriate interventions, planning development can become more inclusive and responsive to the needs of all community members.

### **4. CONCLUSIONS**

This study finds that women's participation in the Deliberation Development Planning (City Development Planning) in Makassar City remains low. Only about 30% of the participants are women. Despite this, women's contributions through proposal submissions show significant potential to improve development planning, with many proposals addressing issues important to society, especially those affecting women and children. Several factors influence women's participation: 1) patriarchal culture and norms; 2) limited access to information; 3) educational and skill limitations; and 4) policy support.

Overall, women's involvement in City Development Planning in Makassar faces various obstacles that need to be addressed for more inclusive and responsive development. Increasing women's participation requires a multidimensional approach, including better access to information and education, and changing social norms that restrict women's roles in planning. Implementing these measures can help maximize women's roles in development, leading to policies and programs that are relevant and sustainable for the entire community.

The study also reveals that social norms and power dynamics are key factors influencing women's participation in Makassar City's development planning. Specifically: 1) Discrimination and stereotypes: Social norms that dismiss women's roles and reinforce gender stereotypes hinder their active engagement. Many women feel pressured to conform to traditional roles, which prevents them from expressing opinions publicly; 2) Education and awareness: A lack of understanding about why involvement in planning matters, compounded by norms that portray women as powerless in development, highlights the need for more educational efforts and awareness campaigns to boost women's participation (Kabeer, 2019); 3) Male dominance: Power dynamics often favor men in decision-making, leading to structural inequalities. Women's voices are frequently ignored in key decisions, which negatively impacts policy quality; 4) Limited access to information and resources also restricts women's involvement. Without adequate access, women cannot participate effectively in development planning.

# Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)

## AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

Syamsidar, Mansur Suma, Sadhriany Pertiwi Saleh, conceived, designed, analyzed the data and wrote the paper.

## CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## REFERENCES

### Books and Articles

- 1) Aminah, S. (2019). The Role of Women in Urban Development in Makassar. *Journal Gender Studies*.
- 2) Asri, R. (2019). The Meaning of The Power of Emak-Emak in Social Media. *Journal of Global Communication*, 8(1), 92–103. <https://doi.org/10.24815/JKG.V8I1.13825>
- 3) Bappenas . (2019). Gender Mainstreaming in Development Planning.
- 4) Becker, Howard S. (1963). "Outsiders: Studies in the Sociology of Deviance." Free Press.
- 5) Bennett, L. (2019). *Gender and Urban Planning: A Global Perspective*. Routledge.
- 6) Berger, P. L., & Luckmann , T. (1966). *The Social Construction of Reality: A Treatise in the Sociology of Knowledge*. Anchor Books.
- 7) Black, Donald. (1998). "The Social Structure of Right and Wrong." Academic Press.
- 8) Bourdieu, P. (1986). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Harvard University Press.
- 9) Braithwaite, John. (1989). "Crime, Shame and Reintegration." Cambridge University Press.
- 10) Butler, J. (1990). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. Routledge.
- 11) Chambliss, William J. (1973). "The Saints and the Roughnecks." *Society*, 11(3), 21-27.
- 12) Checkland, P. (1999). *Systems Thinking, Systems Practice*. Wiley.
- 13) Chomsky, N. (2002). *Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media*. Pantheon Books.
- 14) Cialdini, R.B., Reno, R.R., & Kallgren, C.A. (1990). A Focus Theory of Normative Conduct: A Theoretical Refinement and Reevaluation of the Role of Norms in Human Behavior. In *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology* (Vol. 24, pp. 201-234). Academic Press.
- 15) Cohen, Albert K. (1955). "Delinquent Boys: The Culture of the Gang." Free Press.
- 16) Cornwall, A. (2008). "Unpacking 'Participation': Models, meanings and practices." *Community Development Journal*, 43(3), 269-283.
- 17) Cornwall, A., & Jewkes, R. (1995). "What is participatory research?" *Social Science & Medicine*, 41(12), 1667-1676.
- 18) Crenshaw, K. (1991). *Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color*. Stanford Law Review.
- 19) Durkheim, E. (1897). *Le Suicide: Étude de sociologie*. Felix Alcan.
- 20) Durkheim, Émile. (1895). "The Normal and the Pathological." In *The Rules of Sociological Method*. Free Press, 1982.
- 21) Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Vintage Books.
- 22) Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977*. Pantheon Books.
- 23) Friedman, E. (2020). "Gender and Political Participation in Indonesia: Challenges and Opportunities." *Asian Journal of Political Science*.
- 24) Goffman, Erving. (1963). "Stigma: Notes on the Management of Spoiled Identities." Prentice Hall.
- 25) Hanan, A., & Indonesian Team. (2019). "Women's Involvement in Civil Society Organizations: A Study on Developmental Participation." *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences*.
- 26) Haq, S., & Sulaiman , A. (2021). Inclusive Urban Development: The Role of Women in Planning. *Urban Studies Journal*.
- 27) Hasyim, I. (2020). Social Norms and Women's Participation in Development in Indonesia. *Journal of Social and Cultural Affairs*.
- 28) Hirschi, Travis. (1969). "Causes of Delinquency." University of California Press.
- 29) Kabeer, N. (1999). "Resources, Agency, Achievements: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment." *Development and Change*, 30(3), 435- 464.
- 30) Kabeer, N. (2019). *Gender Equality, Economic Growth, and Women's Empowerment*. UNDP.

## Dynamics of Power Relations and Social Norms in Women's Participation in Development Planning (Case Study in the City of Makassar, South Sulawesi)

- 31) Ministry of National Development Planning/ Bappenas. (2020). Report Women's Participation in City Development Plannin .
- 32) LaFree , Gary, & Tseloni , Andromachi . (2006). "Demographic and Developmental Changes in the Risk of Property Crime: A Multinational Examination." *European Journal of Population*, 22(2), 163-184.
- 33) Lindblom, C.E. (1959). "The Science of 'Muddling Through'." *Public Administration Review*, 19(2), 79-88.
- 34) Lukes , S. (2005). *Power: A Radical View*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- 35) Meyer, M. W., & Winer, M. (1993). The Planning Process: An Overview. In *Public Planning: Policy, Issues, and Practice* (pp. 15-36).
- 36) Miller, C. (2022). Women's Voices in Urban Planning: Challenges and Opportunities. *City & Community*.
- 37) Molyneux, M. (2002). "Gender and the Politics of Rights." *New Left Review*, 2(14), 1-19.
- 38) Risman, B. J. (2018). *Where the Millennials Will Take Us: A New Generation Rewrites the Rules of Gender*. New York: New York University Press.
- 39) Said, E. W. (1978). *Orientalism*. Vintage Books.
- 40) Sampson, Robert J., & Laub, John H. (1993). "Crime in the Making: Pathways and Turning Points Through Life." Harvard University Press.
- 41) Scott, J. W. (1988). *Gender and the Politics of History*. Columbia University Press.
- 42) Subhan, A. (2021). Dynamics Women's Involvement in Regional Planning. *Journal Development Planning*
- 43) Tilly, C. (2001). Mechanisms in Political Processes. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 4(1), 21-41.
- 44) UN Women. (2020). *Gender Equality in Urban Planning: A Global Overview*. UN Women Publications.
- 45) Weber, M. (1947). *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. Free Press.

### WEBSITE

- 1) DP3A South Sulawesi push improvement role women in politics - ANTARA News Makassar. (nd). Retrieved November 4, 2023, from <https://makassar.antaranews.com/berita/435321/dp3a-sulsel-dorong-peningkatan-peran-perempuan-di-bidang-political>
- 2) DPPPA Makassar Encourages Women's Participation in the Economic Sector- UMKM-klikkiri.co.(nd). Retrieved November 4, 2023, from <https://klikkiri.co/2023/09/28/dpppa-makassar-dorong-partisipasi-perempuan-di-bidang-ekonomi-umkm/>
- 3) Involvement Women's Group in Election Mayor of Makassar in 2020 during Covid- 19 | NeoRespublica: Journal of Government Scienc . (nd). Retrieved November 4, 2023, from
- 4) <https://neorespublica.uho.ac.id/index.php/journal/article/view/88>
- 5) Muhammad, R., Iqbal Latief , M., & Study Sociology , P. (2023). Engagement Women's Group in Election Mayor of Makassar in 2020 during Covid-19. *NeoRespublica : Journal of Government Science* , 4(2), 455–466. <https://doi.org/10.52423/NEORESJURNAL.V4I2.88>
- 6) Nursiah Lalboe , author. (2006). The role of women in the process of taking decisions in the environment bureaucracy the relation with resilience area: study cases in government Makassar City. Postgraduate Program, University of Indonesia. <https://lib.ui.ac.id>
- 7) Participation political women: Study about factors that influence participation political Woman in party politics in Makassar. (nd). Retrieved November 4, 2023, from <https://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/penelitian/detail/32900>
- 8) The role of women in the process of taking decisions in the environment bureaucracy the relation with resilience area: study cases in government Makassar city. (nd). Retrieved November 4, 2023, from <https://lib.ui.ac.id/m/detail.jsp?id=107236&location=lokal>



There is an Open Access article, distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution – Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits remixing, adapting and building upon the work for non-commercial use, provided the original work is properly cited.