

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review



Ni Luh Riska Yusmarisa¹, Ida Ayu Nyoman Saskara², Ni Putu Wiwin Setyari³,
I Nyoman Mahaendra Yasa⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Faculty of Economic and Business, Udayana University, Indonesia

ABSTRACT: One of the issues that emerged in tourism sector employment during the recovery period from the Covid-19 pandemic was the decline in the quality of human resources, namely related to the labor who previously worked in the tourism sector not all returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of tourism recovering. This creates problems in labor supply that require resolution. Labor supply research has been used in various ways and has attracted the attention of academics and practitioners as well as governments because it has an important role in policy making. Method By understanding labor supply based on a literature review, strategies can be developed and implemented to solve the problem of labor supply in the tourism sector in an effort to create a new balance, namely that the Bali economy does not only rely on the tourism sector but also other potential sectors. This article also provides direction for future studies to solve tourism sector labor problems during the recovery period from the Covid-19 pandemic.

KEYWORDS: Labor Supply, Tourism Sector, Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery

I. INTRODUCTION

One of the issues that emerged in tourism sector employment during the recovery period from the Covid-19 pandemic was the decline in the quality of human resources, namely related to the workforce who previously worked in the tourism sector not all returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of tourism recovering. This creates problems in labor supply that require resolution. The World Health Organization (WHO) declared global pandemic status due to Corona Virus Disease (Covid19) which caused a multidimensional crisis in all parts of the world (Pitoyo, et al., 2020; Martanti, et al., 2021). Workers' incomes have decreased, people's purchasing power has weakened, and companies have experienced a significant decline in income due to Covid-19 (Kurniawan, et al., 2018). The Covid-19 pandemic is a problem in all fields including tourism. Income in the tourism sector has decreased due to the decline in the number of tourists coming to Bali. This also has an impact on reducing the number of workers needed so that many workers experience layoffs, are laid off temporarily, and work hours are reduced. The World Health Organization (WHO) declared global pandemic status on March 11, 2020. The Covid-19 pandemic has affected the tourism sector on a global scale, where in various parts of the world there has been a sharp decline in aviation, hotel, land and sea transportation services (CEIC, 2020). The world travel industry experienced a significant decline in income, both in Europe, North America, Latin America, the Middle East, Africa and Asia Pacific (Becker, 2020). Europe was affected the most with a decline in income of minus 46 percent (%) and the smallest decline in North America was minus 27 percent (%). Economic sectors related to tourism are expected to be affected by the Covid-19 pandemic (CEIC, 2020). The Covid-19 pandemic has had an uneven impact on employment and income of different workers, thereby affecting household per capita income and income inequality.

According to the Bali Province Central Statistics Agency (2021), direct arrivals of foreign tourists (tourists) to Bali in March 2020 were recorded at 156,876 visits. When compared with March 2019 (year on year), the number of foreign tourists was recorded to have decreased by 65.11 percent because in March 2019, there were 449,569 foreign tourist visits. The arrival of foreign tourists (tourists) to Bali in March 2021 amounted to 3 visits, down 99.998 percent compared to the record number of foreign tourists in March 2020 which was 167,461 visits. According to the Bali Province Central Statistics Agency (2022), in March 2022, there were 14,620 foreign tourist visits coming directly to Bali. When compared with February 2022 (month-to-month), there was a very high increase of up to thousands of percent (1,016.03 percent). Termination of Employment Relations (PHK)

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

was carried out due to emergency conditions (*force majeure*) so not all of them went through the proper procedures. There are companies that implement permanent layoffs and there are also those that implement temporary layoffs. Recovery from the Covid-19 pandemic has increased economic growth, followed by growth in people's purchasing power, making companies reemploy employees who had been laid off. The pandemic recovery which has had an impact on increasing tourist visits does not directly result in the return of tourism workers to work again in the same field. Based on a human resources perspective, employees who have been laid off for a long time may not necessarily be able to return to work, so companies have to train new employees. If professional employees can return to work, they must be paid enough so that tourism recovery requires time and investment.

During the Covid-19 pandemic, reducing working hours is unavoidable. There are workers who can still work but a reduction in working hours or even termination of employment (PHK) is inevitable (Khamis et al, 2021; Romlah, 2020; Balde et al, 2020; ILO, 2003; Ahmed et al, 2020). Shifting of the workforce from 2018 to 2022 (Central Statistics Agency, 2022) occurred, this caused changes in the composition of the workforce during the Covid-19 pandemic. In August 2019 the composition of the labor for Accommodation and Food and Beverage Providers was 13.27%, then in August 2020 it decreased to 9.75%. In August 2021 it decreased again to 9.58%, while in August 2022 it increased to 12.07%. The development of Bali's economic structure (%) from 2019 to 2022 based on Business Fields shows that Accommodation and Food and Beverage Providers experienced the highest percentage changes compared to other business fields. According to Bank Indonesia (2022), there are 4 challenges to recovering the Tourism Sector, namely a decline in the quality of human resources, supply chain disruption, a decline in physical quality, and difficulty in accessing credit. The decline in the quality of human resources is related to employees who previously worked in the HOREKA sector (hotels, restaurants and cafes) not all returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of the recovery of tourism. Supply chain disruptions, namely related to increased demand, have not been followed by readiness on the supply side because they are still affected by the scarring effect which affects production capacity (food ingredients, availability of hotel equipment, etc.). The decline in physical quality is related to the quality of facilities and infrastructure that were damaged after being vacuum operated during the pandemic and therefore require repairs. Existing facilities cannot be fully operated. The difficulty in accessing credit is related to tourism business actors needing additional capital to reopen their businesses, but applying for credit top ups is still hampered because many are still categorized as a risky sector.

Based on this, one of the challenges of recovering the tourism sector is the decline in the quality of human resources, namely related to employees who previously worked in the HOREKA sector (hotels, restaurants and cafes) not all of them returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of the recovery of tourism. The shortage of trained workers amidst the recovery of tourism is causing problems in the supply of tourism workers. This requires a strategy for involving tourism workers in the development of the tourism sector in Bali. Labor supply can be measured by the number of hours worked. The Covid-19 pandemic has raised problems, one of which is in the labor sector. Due to pressure during the Covid-19 pandemic, in the second quarter of 2020 positive growth was still recorded in several business categories. The highest positive growth was recorded in Category A (Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries). When compared to the first quarter of 2019 (year-on-year), Bali's economy in the first quarter of 2020 recorded negative growth of 1.14 percent. Negative growth was found in Category I (Provision of Accommodation and Food and Drink based on business field) namely -9.11 percent. Based on q-to-q (compared to the previous quarter), the Bali economy in the first quarter of 2020 also had a negative growth rate, namely -7.67 percent. According to the business field, the deepest negative growth was also found in Category I (Provision of Accommodation and Food and Drink), namely -15.12 percent. Bali's economic structure in the first quarter of 2020 was recorded as still being dominated by Category I (Provision of Accommodation and Food and Drink) with a contribution of 21.81 percent (Bali Province Central Statistics Agency, 2020).

Based on this phenomenon, it is important to conduct research regarding whether or not tourism workers will return to their original place of work before the pandemic. This is related to the supply of labor before and during the Covid-19 pandemic. During the Covid-19 pandemic, the demand and supply of labor experienced problems, but in this research what is discussed is the supply of labor. Tourism workers have the choice to work again in the tourism sector or choose a new job during the Covid-19 pandemic. The importance of research regarding the labor supply in the tourism sector in Bali during the Covid-19 pandemic is to understand and analyze the labor supply and policy making in the tourism sector employment. Literature Review using Labor Supply Theory, Leisure Choice, Work and Leisure Decisions, the Concept of Labor Supply, Employment, and Tourism. The labor's choice in allocating time between work time and non-work time (leisure) will place several levels of rewards (wages) expected by the workforce according to Ehrenberg and Smith (2003). The labor supply curve is the relationship between hours worked and wages. The wage level is above the reservation wage, the labor supply curve has a positive slope, but at a certain point, the situation changes and the number of hours of work offered decreases as wages increase, resulting in the slope of the labor supply curve becoming negative. A curve like this is called a backward-bending labor supply curve (Borjas, 2016). The amount of working

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

time provision is related to changes in wage levels. There are two categories of labor supply problems (Ehrenberg and Smith, 2003), namely:

- 1) Individual decisions, namely dividing their time between work and leisure. This is related to individual participation in the workforce. Work part-time or full-time work, time to be at home and work for pay.
- 2) The decision to accept a job and the problem of working in another geography/region.

Labor supply is the amount of labor that can be provided at each possible wage in a certain time period. Classical resource theory states that humans (workers) are individuals who are free to make decisions about whether to work or not. Apart from this, workers are also free to determine the number of working hours they want. This theory is based on consumer theory which states that each individual aims to maximize satisfaction with the constraints they face. Individual satisfaction can be obtained by consuming or enjoying free time (leisure). The obstacles faced by individuals in this regard are income level and time. Working as a contradiction to leisure causes suffering, so people only want to do it if they get compensation in the form of income, so the solution to this individual problem is the number of working hours they want to offer at the desired wage and price level. According to Layard and Walters, quoted by Michael Paul Todaro, an individual's decision to increase or decrease free time is influenced by the level of wages and non-work income. The level of productivity always changes according to the production phase with a pattern of first increasing to a peak and then decreasing (Todaro, 2006). Each individual has the choice to use their time for 168 hours per week with a variety of different choices, namely to work or to rest. Each individual needs a fixed biological time, namely for sleeping, eating, and so on. Based on the assumption that the constant requirement is 68 hours per week (or at least 10 hours per day), then the remaining time is 100 hours per week, different choices can be made (Kaufman & Hotchkiss, 1999). There are two things you can do, namely work or leisure. Work is doing activities that will earn income, while leisure is the opposite. Work is time spent earning income from work. Leisure is time spent but does not result in payment for the work done. Information about the optimal division of work and leisure time is described in the indifference curve (individual preferences for work) and budget constraints (Borjas, 2016).

The concept of labor supply consists of several dimensions, including (McConnell, Brue, and Macpherson, 1999):

1. Size and demographic composition of the population which depends on births, deaths and population movements (net immigration)
2. Labor force participation rate, which is the percentage of working-age population with actual working or seeking work; Labor supply is the amount of labor that can be provided at each possible wage in a certain time period.

Classical theory states that human resources (workers) are individuals who are free to make decisions about whether to work or not. Apart from this, workers are also free to determine the number of working hours they want. This theory is based on consumer theory, namely that each individual aims to maximize satisfaction with the constraints they face. Individual satisfaction can be obtained by consuming or enjoying free time (leisure). The obstacles faced by individuals in this regard are income level and time. Labor absorption can be influenced by external factors and internal factors of a business. Technology-based businesses have lower labor absorption, in other words the more sophisticated the technology used, the lower the need for labor. Labor demand can be shown through the number of people working in a period so that the number of people working is a job opportunity (Alfred in Sadono Sukirno, 1995). Tourism (according to its broad definition) is travel from one place to another. This is temporary and is carried out by individuals or groups as an effort to find balance or harmony and happiness with the environment in social, cultural, natural and scientific dimensions (Spillane, 2002). According to the opinion expressed by Yoeti, (1991). The benefits of tourism from an economic perspective are that tourism can generate foreign exchange for the country so that it can improve the economy of a country. (Yoeti, 1997).

Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism Chapter II Article 4 states that tourism has the following aims.

- a. Increasing economic growth;
- b. Improving people's welfare;
- c. Eradicating poverty;
- d. Overcoming unemployment;
- e. Preserving nature, environment and resources;
- f. Advancing culture;
- g. Raising the nation's image;
- h. Fostering a sense of love for the country;
- i. Strengthening national identity and unity; And
- j. Strengthening friendship between nations.

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

According to Pitana and Diarta (2009), there are many positive impacts of tourism on the economy, including the following: a.

Positive Impact of Tourism on the Economy

- 1) Income from foreign exchange; Improve foreign trade balance;
- 2) Income from business or tourism business;
- 3) Government income;
- 4) Absorption of labor;
- 5) Multiplier effects;
- 6) Utilization of tourism facilities by local communities.

b. Negative Impact of Tourism on the Economy
According to Pitana and Diarta (2009), in general this negative impact has a smaller magnitude than the positive impact. These negative impacts include the following:

- 1) Too much dependence on tourism;
- 2) Rising inflation rates and rapidly increasing land prices;
- 3) the tendency to import materials needed for tourism so that local products are not absorbed;
- 4) The seasonal nature of tourism cannot be predicted precisely, causing the return on investment capital to be uncertain;
- 5) The emergence of other additional costs for the local economy.

Tourism is an integral part of development, so the government has issued Law Number 10 of 2009 concerning tourism. As stated in article 1 paragraph 3, tourism is defined as various kinds of tourist activities and is supported by various facilities and services provided by the community, entrepreneurs, government and regional governments. This law aims to encourage equal distribution of business opportunities and obtain benefits in facing changes in life both locally, nationally and globally. The tourism sector has a significant role in the Indonesian economy, both in adding value, generating foreign exchange, as well as creating jobs and empowering communities. The tourism sector is a labor-intensive industrial sector, based on work skills and professionalism which can increase greatly along with the development of the tourism industry. The normal working hours limit set by the International Labor Organization (ILO) is 48 hours a week. Based on this, someone who works more than 48 hours a week is categorized as someone who works excessive hours. The ILO determines that work with excessive working hours is considered inappropriate work. Decent working hours are no more or less based on a predetermined amount. Excessive working hours are a sign that hourly wages are inadequate, and have an adverse impact on workers' physical and mental health. Apart from this, excessive working hours will reduce worker productivity, as well as disrupt personal life and relationships with family. Insufficient working hours indicate underemployment, or workers' abilities that have not been utilized optimally at work and the income received by workers is not optimal, especially if wages are paid based on hours worked. This is because excessive working hours can increase the risk of injury and illness, as well as reducing worker morale and productivity which leads to a decline in the level of welfare. This research discusses whether or not tourism workers will return to their original workplace before the pandemic. The difference between this and previous research is that it discusses whether or not tourism workers will return to their initial workplace before the pandemic in relation to the supply of labor during the Covid-19 pandemic. It is hoped that research regarding the tourism sector's labor supply during the Covid-19 pandemic in Bali can become a policy reference for employment development, especially in the tourism sector. Research has been carried out regarding labor conditions during the Covid-19 pandemic, namely measuring labor supply and demand shocks during Covid-19 (Brinca et al, 2021). Research has been conducted regarding the influence of the Covid-19 pandemic on the hotel industry, namely regarding Covid-19: hotel industry response to the pandemic evolution and to the public sector economic measures (Torrell, et al., 2020).

Research results stating that it is important to carry out further investigations regarding the impact of natural disasters, namely the Covid-19 pandemic, have also been carried out. Disaster mitigation and preparedness play an important role in mitigating the devastating impacts of disasters and reducing households' vulnerability to poverty. Policy recommendations are also produced from this study, namely Natural disasters, mitigation and household welfare in Indonesia: Evidence from a largescale longitudinal survey (Dartanto, 2022). Brinca, et al. (2021) in their research measured labor demand and supply shocks at the sector level around the Covid-19 outbreak by estimating Bayesian structural vector autoregression on monthly statistics of working hours and real wages. Torrell Research (2020). Dartanto (2022) in his research found that further investigation into the impact of natural disasters on household welfare is very important and timely, especially during the Covid-19 era. Disaster mitigation and preparedness play an important role in mitigating the devastating impacts of disasters and reducing households' vulnerability to poverty.

II. METHOD

This research is research using a literature study method. This research describes the recovery period from the Covid-19 pandemic which is related to the decline in the quality of human resources, namely that not all of the workers who previously

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

worked in the tourism sector returned, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of the recovery of tourism. A literature review or theoretical framework in empirical research has various functions, especially providing a theoretical basis for the research.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Labor supply problems occur in various countries, namely leading hotel chains in Europe are looking for staff without work experience. Workers choose not to return because they have found better jobs, so hotel entrepreneurs have difficulty finding workers (Tempo.co, 2022). Many workers have decided to move to other sectors, so hotels are starting the industry from scratch and struggling to find talent. (Tempo.co, 2022; Antara, 2022). Apart from European countries, namely the United States, jobs in the tourism and hospitality sector are starting to become less of an option as this sector is under pressure due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Many employees who have worked in tourism and hospitality in the United States are apparently not interested in returning to work in this sector, even though demand is expected to increase after the pandemic is over (kabar24.bisnis.com, 2021). Based on this, tourism workers have the choice to work again in the tourism sector or choose a new job during the Covid 19 pandemic. According to Bank Indonesia (2022), there are 4 challenges to the recovery of the tourism sector, namely a decline in the quality of human resources, supply disruptions. chain, decline in physical quality, and difficulty in accessing credit. The decline in the quality of human resources is related to employees who previously worked in the HOREKA sector (hotels, restaurants and cafes) not all returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of the recovery of tourism. Supply chain disruptions, namely related to increased demand, have not been followed by readiness on the supply side because they are still affected by the scarring effect which affects production capacity (food ingredients, availability of hotel equipment, etc.). The decline in physical quality is related to the quality of facilities and infrastructure that were damaged after being vacuum operated during the pandemic and therefore require repairs. Existing facilities cannot be fully operated. The difficulty in accessing credit is related to tourism business actors needing additional capital to reopen their businesses, but applying for credit top ups is still hampered because many are still categorized as a risky sector.

Sri Mulyani, Minister of Finance (2022) at the UOB Economic Outlook 2023 event, said that the Covid-19 pandemic had left a scarring effect or a very deep wound effect on the economy, (kumparan.com). The Covid-19 pandemic has caused a lot of downturns for people in various countries, 10 million creative workers in the world have lost their jobs due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Minister of Education and Culture, Nadiem Makarim (2022) said that someone who has had a bad history in the job market, for example being often unemployed or has been out of the workforce for a long time, will have a greater possibility of being trapped in a vicious cycle of economic activity status. not profitable in the future. If this condition occurs continuously, in the long term it will result in the scarring effect phenomenon, namely a condition where a person's poor job status at the moment or at the beginning of his career will cause injury and have a negative impact on the person's career status. this at a later date (Arulampalam et al, 2000; Tumino, 2015; Quarina, 2017). The results of analysis of individual-level longitudinal studies regarding labor market dynamics in several developed countries have proven the scarring phenomenon of 'bad' economic status, unemployment and not being in the labor force, as well as persistence in a person's status in the labor market (Quarina, 2017). Arulampalam (2001) researched that unemployment does have a scarring effect on individuals who experience it, in terms of loss of income in re-employment jobs. Specifically, it was found that unemployed individuals who return to work earn about 6 percent less than comparable individuals who transition jobs during their first year of employment in their research entitled *Is Unemployment Really Scarring? Effects of Unemployment Experiences on Wages*.

Research has been carried out regarding labor conditions during the Covid-19 pandemic, namely measuring labor supply and demand shocks during Covid-19 (Brinca et al, 2021). Research has been conducted regarding the influence of the Covid-19 pandemic on the hotel industry, namely regarding Covid-19: hotel industry response to the pandemic evolution and to the public sector economic measures (Torrell et al, 2020). Research results stating that it is important to carry out further investigations regarding the impact of natural disasters, namely the Covid-19 pandemic, have also been carried out. Disaster mitigation and preparedness play an important role in reducing the devastating impacts of disasters. Policy recommendations were also produced from this study, namely Natural disasters, mitigation and household welfare in Indonesia: Evidence from a large-scale longitudinal survey (Dartanto, 2022). Changes in labor supply can be decomposed into two labor supply behaviors: wide margins, which represent the entry and exit of workers from the labor market; and the intensive margin, which shows changes in hours worked in response to changes in wages. Brinca et al (2021) in their research measured shocks in labor demand and supply at the sector level around the Covid-19 outbreak by estimating Bayesian structural vector autoregression on monthly statistics of working hours and real wages. Torrell's research (2021), the main results show, on the one hand, the hospitality industry has been negatively affected by the evolution of Covid-19. On the other hand, hotel share prices are positively correlated with economic policies with a direct impact on the public budget, while measures with an indirect impact, such as the provision of liquidity or financial

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

assistance, do not seem to support the industry. Research by Wang et al (2022) states that during an epidemic/pandemic, the tourism sector can benefit greatly from general economic policies that support the economy, such as increasing government investment, stimulating consumption, and cutting taxes. However, the epidemic/pandemic will definitely have a large and prolonged impact on the tourism sector, so that recovery in these sectors will be slower than in other sectors. Consequently, complementary tourism-oriented recovery policies are needed to regain the trust of the tourism industry and to enable full and rapid economic recovery. Nyaruwata (2021) in his research shows that the outbreak of the Covid-19 pandemic in Wuhan province in China in December 2019 and its subsequent spread throughout the world brought the tourism industry to a standstill. Businesses were closed and a large number of workers including those in the tourism industry lost their jobs. Research has been carried out regarding tourism recovery policies, namely regarding The Impact of Covid-19 on the Chinese Tourism Industry (Wang, 2022).

Recovery in the tourism sector during the Covid-19 pandemic requires a reliable labor. The increasing number of tourists must be balanced with increasing the competency of the tourism sector labor. The tourism sector trend requires skilled and specialized workers such as hotels, restaurants, coffee shops, cruise ships and other recreational areas (Adhinegara, 2021). The potential for a rebound in Indonesian tourism during the pandemic will have an impact on gradually increasing human resource needs. A superior vocational workforce is urgently needed to rebuild the Indonesian tourism industry which was sluggish due to the pandemic (Fahmi, 2021). A qualified labor is needed to face the recovery period from the Covid-19 pandemic. The implementation of disaster mitigation preparations such as training and provision can reduce the impact of disasters (Dartanto, Teguh, 2022). The number of workers working in the Tourism Sector in Bali from 2018 to 2022 has changed, since the Covid 19 pandemic, the number of workers has decreased and will increase again in 2022 (Central Statistics Agency, 2022). The Covid-19 pandemic has presented extraordinary challenges that accompany uncertainty. But Covid-19 has reminded humanity that uncertainty also contains great potential to raise awareness, sensitivity to interdependence and become a source of hope for educational progress. Mobilization and participation of all parties is needed in building the future of the world of education (Lestari, 2021). The uncertainty of the Covid-19 pandemic can provide an opportunity to determine labor development strategies for the tourism sector.

IV. CONCLUSION

Issuing the right policies will of course be useful and during the pandemic in order to save the tourism industry. Policies during the pandemic related to labor have been issued, but in line with unpredictable changes in circumstances, further policies are needed to be effective and efficient. By knowing the factors that influence job offers in the tourism industry, especially during the Covid-19 pandemic, you will be able to determine policies that suit the needs of the Covid-19 pandemic recovery. Based on the literature review carried out, there is still a gap for research on labor supply by discussing the factors that influence labor supply. There are many factors that influence the supply of labor. However, in general, wages, education, age and skills are theoretically influencing factors. The implication of this literature review in the tourism industry is that it can contribute to the tourism sector workforce in facing the Covid-19 pandemic. Furthermore, the tourism sector is transforming to increase the strength of the tourism sector and other sectors. The aim of this literature review is to formulate alternative policy scenarios to solve the tourism sector labor problem in a sustainable manner.

Regarding the direction of further research, this research can be continued by conducting research on labor supply to determine the response of labors to the recovery of the Covid-19 pandemic, to find out the most dominant factors that influence the recovery period of the Covid-19 pandemic, and to overcome. The problem of decreasing the quality of human resources is related to the labor who previously worked in the tourism sector not all returning, causing a shortage of trained personnel in the midst of the recovery of tourism. The strategy that can be implemented in solving the problem of labor supply in the tourism sector in an effort to create a new balance is that the Bali economy does not only rely on the tourism sector but also other potential sectors.

REFERENCES

- 1) Adhinegara, Bhima Yudhistira. 2021. Rebound Pariwisata Butuh Tenaga Kerja yang Mumpuni. Travel News. <https://travel.detik.com/travel-news/d-5515156/rebound-pariwisata-butuh-tenaga-kerja-yang-mumpuni>.
- 2) Ahmed, M. S, et al. 2020. Impact of The Covid-19 Pandemic on Migrant Workers in The Informal Sector and Spin-off Effects in Their Destination and Home Countries. T20 Saudi Arabia.
- 3) Antaranews.com. 2022. UNWTO: Sektor Pariwisata Pulih 2022 Setelah Pandemi. <https://bisnis.tempo.co/read/1637806/unwto-sektor-pariwisata-pulih-2022-setelah-pandemi> .Pebruari 2022.
- 4) Arulampalam, W. 2001. Is Unemployment Really Scarring? Effects of Unemployment Experiences on Wages. The Economic Journal, 111(475), pp.585-606.

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

- 5) Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali. 2020. www.bps.go.id.
- 6) Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali. 2021. www.bps.go.id.
- 7) Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali. 2022. www.bps.go.id.
- 8) Balde, R., et al. 2020. Labour Market Effects of COVID- 19 in Sub- Saharan Africa: An Informality Lens from Burkina Faso, Mali and Senegal. In Working Paper Series: Maastricht Economic and social Research institute on Innovation and Technology (UNU- MERIT).
- 9) Bank Indonesia. 2022. Pertemuan Tahunan Bank Indonesia (PTBI): Kilas Balik 2022 dan Prospek Ekonomi Bali 2023 Sinergi dan Inovasi Memperkuat Ketahanan dan Kebangkitan Menuju Indonesia Maju.
- 10) Becker, E. (2020). How Hard Will the Coronavirus Hit The Travel Industry?. Dipublikasikan pada 2 April 2020, diunduh dari <https://www.nationalgeographic.com/travel/2020/04/>
- 11) Borjas, George J. 2016. Labor Economics (Seventh Edition). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- 12) Brinca, P., Duarte, J.B. and Faria-e-Castro, M. 2021. Measuring labor supply and demand shocks during COVID-19. *European Economic Review*, 139, p.103901.
- 13) CEIC.(2020). Indonesia Premium Database. Diunduh 15 September 2020 dari website <https://insights.ceicdata.com/node/INDONESIA>
- 14) Dartanto, Teguh. 2022. Natural disasters, mitigation and household welfare in Indonesia: Evidence from a large-scale longitudinal survey. *Cogent Economics&Finance*, 10:1, 2037250, DOI: 10.1080/23322039.2022.2037250.
- 15) Ehrenberg, Ronald G and Robert S.Smith. 2003. Modern Labor Economics. Theory and Public Policy. Sixth Edition. Glenview Illinois: Scott Foreman and Company.
- 16) Fahmi, Muhammad 2021. Rebound Pariwisata Butuh Tenaga Kerja yang Mumpuni. *Travel News*. <https://travel.detik.com/travel-news/d-5515156/rebound-pariwisata-butuh-tenaga-kerja-yang-mumpuni>.
- 17) ILO. 2003. General Report Seventeenth International Conference of Labour Statisticians, Desember 2003. ILO: Geneva.
- 18) Kabar24.bisnis.com. 2021. Pekerjaan di Sektor Pariwisata dan Hotel Tak Lagi Menarik? <https://kabar24.bisnis.com/read/20210713/19/1417120/pekerjaan-di-sektor-pariwisata-dan-hotel-tak-lagi-menarik>
- 19) Kaufman, Bruce E dan Hotchkiss Julie L, 1999. The Economics of Labor Markets, Fifth Edition, The Dryden Press.
- 20) Khamis, M., Prinz, D., Newhouse, D., Palacios-Lopez, A., Pape, U., & Weber, M. (2021). The Early Labor Market Impacts of Covid-19 in Developing Countries. *Job Working Paper In World Bank Issue No 58*.
- 21) Kurniawan, T. S., Wulan Sari, D., & Reni Irmawati, D. (2018). Indonesian Treasury Review. *Jurnal Perbendaharaan, Keuangan Negara dan Kebijakan Publik*.
- 22) Lestari, Denok. 2021. Tantangan Bagi Pendidikan di Bidang Pariwisata Pasca Covid-19. *Book Chapter. Yayasan Guna Widya Paramesthi*.
- 23) Mendikbudristek, Nadiem Makarim 2022.
- 24) <https://edukasi.okezone.com/read/2022/03/24/623/2567261/nadiem-10-jutapekerja-kreatif-kehilangan-pekerjaan-akibatpandemi-covid-19>
- 25) Martanti, D.M., Magdalena, F., Ariska, N. P. D., Setiyawati, N., & Rumboirusi, W. C. B. (2021). Dampak Pandemi Covid-19 terhadap Tenaga Kerja Formal di Indonesia. *Jurnal Populasi Volume 28 Nomor 2 2020*.
- 26) Menteri Keuangan, Sri Mulyani. 2022. <https://kumparan.com/kumparanbisnis/sri-mulyani-pandemi-covid-19tinggalkan-luka-yang-sangat-dalam-ke-ekonomi-1yx6qen9h6w>
- 27) Nyaruwata, Shepherd and Mbasera, Miriam. 2021. A Critique of Contribution of Tourism to Jobs in Southern African Development Community (SADC): Implications for Post Covid-19 Pandemic. *International Tourism and Hospitality Journal* 4(5): 1-18.
- 28) Pitana, I.G. dan I.K.S. Diarta. (2009). Pengantar Ilmu Pariwisata. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Andi.
- 29) Pitoyo, A. J., Aditya, B., & Amri, I. (2020). The Impacts of Covid-19 Pandemic to Informal Economic Sector in Indonesia: Theoretical and Empirical Comparison. *EDP SCIENCES Nomor 200, 03014 (2020)*.
- 30) Quarina, Q. 2017. An analysis of the determinants and scarring effects of economic inactivity and unemployment in the UK (disertasi). Lancaster University (United Kingdom).
- 31) Romlah, S. 2020. Covid-19 dan Dampaknya Terhadap Buruh di Indonesia. „Adalah: Buletin Hukum dan Keadilan, Volume 4 Nomor 1 (2020).
- 32) Spillane. 2002. *Ekonomi Pariwisata, sejarah dan Prospeknya*. Yogyakarta : Kanisius.
- 33) Sukirno, Sadono. 1995. *Ekonomi Pembangunan*, Jakarta: LPEE UI.
- 34) Todaro, Michael Paul. 2006. *Ekonomi Pembangunan*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- 35) Torrell, Oriol Anguera., et al. 2020. Covid-19: Hotel Industry Response to the Pandemic Evolution and to the Public Sector Economic Measures. *Tourism Recreation Research*.

Tourism Sector Labor Supply During the Covid-19 Pandemic Recovery Period in Bali: Literature Review

- 36) Tumino, A. 2015. The scarring effect of unemployment from the early'90s to the Great Recession (No. 2015-05). ISEER Working Paper Series.
- 37) Wang, C., Meng, X., Siriwardana, M. and Pham, T. 2022. The impact of COVID-19 on the Chinese tourism industry. *Tourism Economics*, 28(1), pp:131-152.
- 38) Yoeti, A. Oka. 1997. *Perencanaan dan Pengembangan Pariwisata*. PT Pradnya Paramita. Jakarta.



There is an Open Access article, distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution – Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits remixing, adapting and building upon the work for non-commercial use, provided the original work is properly cited.